AUN-QA PROGRAMME ASSESSMENT REPORT

AUN-QA Assessment No.: 150th AUN-QA Programme Assessment	Date of Assessment: 24-26th June 2019
Name of Programme Assessed: Bachelor in Agribusines	
Name of University: Universitas Sebelas Maret	
Name of Faculty/School: Faculty of Agriculture	
Name of Management Representative/Designation: Ms. Nuning Setyowati	Email: nuning_s@staff.uns.ac.id
Name of Assessors: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Amalina M. Afifi University of Malaya, Malaysia Asst. Prof. Dr. Thasaneeya Ratanaroutai Nopparatjamjomras Mahidol University, Thailand	

Report Summary

This report is based on the information provided in the self-assessment report (SAR), evidences, site tour and interviews with selected stakeholders including academic and support staff, students, alumni and employers. It should be read together with the preliminary findings presented at the closing ceremony where the key strengths and areas for improvement were highlighted.

The AUN-QA assessment at programme level covers 11 criteria and each criterion is assessed based on a 7-point scale. The summary of the assessment results is as follows:

Criteria	Score
1. Expected Learning Outcomes	4
2. Programme Specification	4
3. Programme Structure and Content	4
4. Teaching and Learning Approach	4
5. Student Assessment	5
6. Academic Staff Quality	4
7. Support Staff Quality	4
8. Student Quality and Support	4
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	4
10. Quality Enhancement	3
11. Output	4
Overall Verdict:	**Adequate as Expected**

Based on the assessment results, the Bachelor of XXX Programme fulfilled or not fulfilled the AUN-QA requirements. Overall the quality assurance implemented for the programme is "Adequate as Expected".

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
1. Expected Learning Outcomes	1.1 The expected learning outcomes have been clearly formulated and aligned with the vision and mission of the university [1,2]	The 9 expected learning outcomes (ELOs) have been formulated to support the SPA-UNS' vision which is 'to be an excellent study programme at the international level in the field of agribusiness, with an orientation for sustainable agricultural development to improve community welfare '. The vision and mission of SPA-UNS are aligned with the vision and mission of the university. The ELOs cover for skills (psychomotor), knowledge (cognitive) as well as attitudes (affective) attainment.	Innovative, IT and communication are important skills sought by employers nowadays. These skills can be incorporated into the ELO so that courses can be designed to train students to have these skills, and the outcome can be assessed and monitored. Other suggestions made by the employer: • To share information on curriculum map to graduate career path • To expose students to 3rd language such as Japanese, Korean, Chinese, etc. • To increase nationalism (probably by improving course content/ delivery/ emphasis/ and relate to agribusiness)
1. Expected Learning Outcomes	1.2 The expected learning outcomes cover both subject specific and generic (i.e. transferable) learning outcomes [3]	The ELOs span specific and generic outcomes. (subject specific -ELO3,4,8,9 and generic- ELO 1,2,5,6,7)	This part of ELOs (which one is assigned to subject specific and which to generic/ transferable LOs) can be well communicated to the stakeholders.
1. Expected Learning Outcomes	1.3 The expected learning outcomes clearly reflect the requirements of the stakeholders [4]	The expected learning outcomes reflected the requirements of the stakeholders such as Indonesian National Qualification Framework and National Higher Education Standards (KKNI level 6 and SN-DIKTI), Indonesian Agribusiness Association, alumni, graduate users and lecturers.	The relationship between the stakeholders' needs and ELOs can be clearly mapped so that the rationale and impact of change can be well established and communicated back to the stakeholders.
2. Programme Specification	2.1 The information in the programme specification is comprehensive and up-to-date [1, 2]	Programme specification which consists most of the elements required by the AUN-QA are illustrated and communicated on the website in video form & printed on leaflet.	SPA-UNS can include other information such as period of study, grading, admission criteria or requirements to the programme. This information can be useful to prospective students, parents or agencies seeking expertise in agribusiness.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
2. Programme Specification	2.2 The information in the course specification is comprehensive and up-to-date [1, 2]	SPA-UNS documented course specification in the Semester Course Plan (Rencana Pembelajaran Semester/RPS). Among information describing the courses are course identity, identity and validation, ELOs, CLOs, course description and references, weekly plan, teaching & learning methods as well as assessment methods.	The semester course plan document is not standardized and information was not consistent for all courses. SPA-UNS may consider to use standardized forms to ensure consistency in documenting and communicating the courses' information to students. This can also enable lecturer to revise and improvise course plan in a proper way. It is also recommended that course specifications be regularly reviewed and kept up-to-date particularly references and resources; more e-resources could be included.
2. Programme Specification	2.3 The programme and course specifications are communicated and made available to the stakeholders [1, 2]	The programme specifications are communicated on website and printed on leaflet. The course specifications are communicated and explained to the students in the beginning of the semester.	Programme and course specification can be effectively communicated via various channels to other key stakeholders such as alumni and employers and obtain feedback for improvement. The information regarding programme and course specification should be consistent in all medium (leaflet, student's handbook or others).
3. Programme Structure and Content	3.1 The curriculum is designed based on constructive alignment with the expected learning outcomes [1]	The curriculum has a total of 144 credits which have to be completed in 8 semesters (including community service programme, internship, undergraduate thesis and seminar in semester 7 and 8). Courses which include general and specific knowledge are mapped to the ELOs. Various teaching and learning as well as assessment methods are used to achieve the expected learning outcomes.	It is suggested to revise and refine the course learning outcome (CLO/ sub ELO) to be course specific. The programme can regularly identify topics of contemporary importance at local, national and global levels to continue to support the achievement of University's vision and mission. (Please refer to 1.1)

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
3. Programme Structure and Content	3.2 The contribution made by each course to achieve the expected learning outcomes is clear [2]	The contribution made by each course to achieve the 9 ELOs is clear. This is evident from table 2.3.1. It can be seen that collectively all compulsory courses contribute to the achievement of the 9 ELOs. 13.3% courses contribute to ELO1&2 (attitude), 37.2% of courses contribute to ELO3-4 (knowledge), and 49.5% courses contribute to ELO 5-9 (skill).	It can be useful to clearly show/ map which ELO satisfy which stakeholder's requirement (refer to 1.3).
3. Programme Structure and Content	3.3 The curriculum is logically structured, sequenced, integrated and up-to-date [3, 4, 5, 6]	A balance curriculum has been designed and arranged in logical sequence which include non-technical and technical courses to achieve ELOs. Semester 1 & 2 starts with general knowledge and introductory courses in agribusiness. Semester 3 to 6 focuses on specific and advance knowledge in agribusiness. And community service programme, internship, undergraduate thesis and seminar are arranged in 7th & 8th semester.	-
4. Teaching and Learning Approach	4.1 The educational philosophy is well articulated and communicated to all stakeholders [1]	The educational philosophy of UNS is symbolized in its motto: "Mangesti Luhur Ambangun Nagara, which reflects the following statement: "UNS is an institution for the development of science, technology, and arts, educating students to gain knowledge, skills, and attitude with wisdom and nobility, to contribute in the noble values to build the nation and human well-being with the light of immortality of science. UNS pledges its allegiance and loyalty to the nation, state, homeland, and science.	Not many stakeholders realize and understand the educational philosophy of UNS during the interview session. It is suggested to relook into the educational philosophy and communicate to the stakeholders.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
4. Teaching and Learning Approach	4.2 Teaching and learning activities are constructively aligned to the achievement of the expected learning outcomes [2, 3, 4]	Various teaching and learning activities based on student centered learning including lecture, discussion, problem- based, case study and etc are implemented to achieve ELOs. Some courses use technology such as software and e-learning platform (SIAKAD).	Technology can be further optimized for the delivery of instruction (flip classroom, improve usage of e-learning platform). Agribusiness programme can consider to invite industrial expert or lecturer from university abroad for sharing session of the real work experience.
4. Teaching and Learning Approach	4.3 Teaching and learning activities enhance life-long learning [5]	Various teaching and learning strategies focusing on student-centered learning (e.g. problem-based learning, case study, practicum, research-based learning, assignments) are adopted to enhance life-long learning and ensure ELO achievement. The programme provides a global experience to the student via short-term & long-term exchange programme as well as internship abroad.	It is suggested that the programme to increase the usage of e-learning platform for supporting the student-centered learning and enhance life-long learning skill (refer 4.2). To consider providing more opportunities for student exchange programme.
5. Student Assessment	5.1 The student assessment is constructively aligned to the achievement of the expected learning outcomes [1, 2]	The course specifications/syllabi specify the learning activities and the relevant assessments for these activities are mapped to the ELOs (table 2.5.1 page 20-21). Student assessments are in accordance with the teaching and learning strategies which include formative and summative assessments.	-
5. Student Assessment	5.2 The student assessments including timelines, methods, regulations, weight distribution, rubrics and grading are explicit and communicated to students [4, 5]	The assessments are listed in the semester course plan and communicated to the students in the beginning of the semester.	Please refer to 2.2. The information in semester course plan are not consistent, some courses are missing some of the information. This should be improvise to ensure consistency in communication to the students.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
5. Student Assessment	5.3 Methods including assessment rubrics and marking schemes are used to ensure validity, reliability and fairness of student assessment [6, 7]	Rubrics are used in assessment. Customized rubrics are used for specific activities such thesis, presentations and others.	Rubrics are being used in the assessments, however SPA-UNS programme can further refine the rubrics to detail for the descriptors.
5. Student Assessment	5.4 Feedback of student assessment is timely and helps to improve learning [3]	The timely feedback after every continuous assessment is practiced. This is confirmed by the students where they mentioned that feedback is received 1 week after assessment.	-
5. Student Assessment	5.5 Students have ready access to appeal procedure [8]	There are 2 channels available for students' who need to improved their assessment score/ grades. 1. Standard appeal procedure 2. Remedial test/ exam.	-
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.1 Academic staff planning (considering succession, promotion, re-deployment, termination, and retirement) is carried out to fulfil the needs for education, research and service [1]	The study programme has a total of 26 academic staffs (approximately 1:20 staff-to-students' ratio) 96% of academic staffs are certified professional educators by the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education. There is proper procedure for career development, promotion, redeployment, termination, and termination following the government law, ministry and university's rules and regulations.	The academic staff planning can be made more comprehensive to include list of staffs, area of expertise, rank, academic degree, admin post, leave plans (for eg. sabbatical, maternity, etc.), retirement, recruitment, promotion or others. This is to ensure availability of academic staffs for specific area of expertise/ with specific knowledge to teach certain courses. The comprehensive plan can also enable head of programme/ management to plan for staffs' workload. The programme can invite more guest lecturer from abroad as well as local industries for sharing session and exposure to real work experience.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.2 Staff-to-student ratio and workload are measured and monitored to improve the quality of education, research and service [2]	The programme has a total of 26 active staffs and about 600 active students in the year 2019. 46.15% of academic staffs are PhD holder and the rest are with master's degree including 3 staffs are undergoing PhD candidacy.	The calculation of staff-to- student ratio can be made clearer. The SPA-UNS programme can consider to monitor staff number in every specialization for better staff planning.
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.3 Recruitment and selection criteria including ethics and academic freedom for appointment, deployment and promotion are determined and communicated [4, 5, 6, 7]	Recruitment and selection criteria follow SOP set by the Ministry's regulation. It is standardized for all applicants which includes evaluation on Basic competencies, subject-specific written exam, Micro-teaching exam, and interview with the dean.	-
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.4 Competences of academic staff are identified and evaluated [3]	Competences of academic staff are well identified during recruitment and selection. Competencies are evaluated using Employee Work Target Assessment (SKP) and assessment of work behavior by HOP.	SPA-UNS programme can maintain a competency matrix showing staffs list with expertise, training/ seminar/ postdoc etc attended for better identification and evaluation. The competency matrix can also show the availability of lecturers in certain area of specialization to ensure adequate number of expertise and succession planning.
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.5 Training and developmental needs of academic staff are identified and activities are implemented to fulfil them [8]	All academics staffs attended English language, academic writing, leadership, data analysis, IT-based service training. From 2015-2019, lecturers are planned to attend training that is related to internationalization to achieve the vision and mission of the university.	The SPA-UNS programme has started to implement OBE in 2016. The academic staffs would benefit from more training in OBE as well as in rubrics construction to provide better teaching & learning experience. Training and developmental needs can be easily identified from staffs' competency matrix (refer to 6.4).

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.6 Performance management including rewards and recognition is implemented to motivate and support education, research and service [9]	Academic staff performance is assessed by head of programme, 60% SKP and 40% work behavior. The average score of academic staffs' performance from year 2015-2018 were high which is about 90%. Attendance, teaching & learning plan-do-check-act (PDCA) cycle timeliness, research performance and community service work are evaluated from online data https://iris1103.uns.ac.id. Achievement above standard requirements will be given remuneration https://remunerasi.uns.ac.id.	The programme should also monitor course plan prepared by lecturer from other programme to ensure alignment with Agribusiness study programme's curriculum and ELO's attainment.
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.7 The types and quantity of research activities by academic staff are established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [10]	There are 2 research groups in SPA-UNS to facilitate research in the area of socioeconomic agriculture and agribusiness management. The average publication by SPA-UNS academic staffs is about 1.8 publication/ SPA staffs, this number is higher than the faculty achievement.	The programme management can keep a research database (area of research, publication number/ types, journal types, grants, etc) to monitor research activities by the programme's lecturers and make plan. It is also recommended to benchmark with top Universities in the area of agribusiness and encourage collaboration.
7. Support Staff Quality	7.1 Support staff planning (at the library, laboratory, IT facility and student services) is carried out to fulfil the needs for education, research and service [1]	Support staff numbers in library, laboratory, administrators and IT are monitored.	It is recommended to identify competencies and/or skills of laboratory staffs, which based on vision, mission, and ELOs to meet the needs and service quality of the programme.
7. Support Staff Quality	7.2 Recruitment and selection criteria for appointment, deployment and promotion are determined and communicated [2]	The recruitment, selection, placement, and dismissal of support staff are coordinated by the Personnel Department and Agriculture Faculty of Universitas Sebelas Maret based on the proposed needs of the programme.	-

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
7. Support Staff Quality	7.3 Competences of support staff are identified and evaluated [3]	Education qualifications of the support staff related to the programme are determined.	It is suggested that a competency model be developed to aid in building strategic competencies of support staff and their career development.
7. Support Staff Quality	7.4 Training and developmental needs of support staff are identified and activities are implemented to fulfil them [4]	There are numbers of training and workshops, such as IT, leadership, English, laboratory, and teamwork.	It is recommended to also develop training activities which are based on support staff's needs.
7. Support Staff Quality	7.5 Performance management including rewards and recognition is implemented to motivate and support education, research and service [5]	UNS has a tool to measure support staff performance, which is reviewed and developed by the HR Development Unit and University Remuneration (http://remunerasi.uns.ac.id). UNS provides promotions as a form of appreciation to outstanding staff members.	-
8.Student Quality and Support	8.1 The student intake policy and admission criteria are defined, communicated, published, and up-to-date [1]	Information on new student admissions related to the study programmes, requirements, entry points, registration, and announcements is communicated to high school students through the website http://www.spmb.uns.ac.id/. There were 3 admission channels namely National Selection of State University Admission (SNMPTN), Joint Selection of State University Admission (SBMPTN), and Independent Selection of UNS (SM UNS).	For continuous improvement, it is recommended to review the quality of students' admission due to those three channels for further intake policy.
8.Student Quality and Support	8.2 The methods and criteria for the selection of students are determined and evaluated [2]	The methods and criteria for selecting new students are evaluated periodically.	Refer 8.1

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
8.Student Quality and Support	8.3 There is an adequate monitoring system for student progress, academic performance, and workload [3]	SPA-UNS conducts regular monitoring of student achievement. Verbal warnings (through academic advisors) and written ones will be used for students who cannot achieve the minimum performance.	It is recommended to review the workloads of students according to the average time to graduate in the last 5 years.
8.Student Quality and Support	8.4 Academic advice, co-curricular activities, student competition, and other student support services are available to improve learning and employability [4]	Various support services are available to students, such as consultation services including career development, extracurricular activities, and competition activities.	The current support services, especially competition activities can be reviewed to improve student's learning.
8.Student Quality and Support	8.5 The physical, social and psychological environment is conducive for education and research as well as personal well-being [5]	SPA-UNS provides wireless internet connections with passwords, a social room with a mini-library, Agricultural Economics laboratory and Agribusiness Management laboratory, outlet, computer laboratory, and screen house, mosque, church, temple, etc.	Psychological environment for personal well-being is recommended to be concerned. The programme can make effort to communicate to students about facilities and services that are available in university.
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.1The teaching and learning facilities and equipment (lecture halls, classrooms, project rooms, etc.) are adequate and updated to support education and research [1]	The Faculty of Agriculture, is located at the main campus of UNS in Kentingan, Jebres, Surakarta. The Faculty has 5 buildings with an area of 11,957 m2 that are used for office space, class rooms, lecturer rooms, and laboratory. The Faculty has supporting infrastructures including greenhouses, dry land research farms, and wetlands, as well as buildings for student extracurricular activities. All 29 lecture rooms shared by 7 programmes. Each room is equipped with LCD, whiteboard, eraser, marker, lecturer table, folding chair, a fan, and Wi-Fi.	Considering disruptive technologies, such as virtual and digitalized classrooms, augmented and virtual reality as well as gamification, it is recommended to explore feasibility of current facilities and what kind of improvement is needed.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.2 The library and its resources are adequate and updated to support education and research [3, 4]	The central library has textbooks, e-books, e-journals, etc. Services, at the seven floors of the library, are provided six days a week. Digital library can be access through QR code.	It is recommended to make a follow-up on the availability of course-required reference materials.
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.3 The laboratories and equipment are adequate and updated to support education and research [1, 2]	The non-SPA-UNS laboratory use is related to several compulsory subject areas of the faculty (such as Botany, Agro-climatology, Soil Science, Plant Cultivation Technology, and Plant Protection). Three experimental farms managed by the Soil Science Programme. The farms are located in Jumantono, Jati Kuwung, and Palur. The multimedia laboratory, such as econometrics, statistics, and accounting is managed by SPA-UNS. The lab has an area of 48 m^2 and 40 computer units including Wi-Fi, LCD, PC, router, laptop, AC, and SPSS and other statistics and econometrics tools.	It is recommended to explore what kind of additional facilities are needed to support education and research of the programme, such as related business software.
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.4 The IT facilities including e-learning infrastructure are adequate and updated to support education and research [1, 5, 6]	The information technology facilities are centrally managed by the university under the UNS Integrated Service Unit of Information and Communication Technology. UNS also provides Open Courseware at the website https://www.ocw.uns.ac.id/site/indek. OCW allows students to easily access course plans (RPS) and lecture materials. The e-learning system is located at https://spada.uns.ac.id/ and https://elearning.uns.ac.id/.	Feedback may be gathered from academic staffs to improve IT facilities in computer lab.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.5 The standards for environment, health and safety; and access for people with special needs are defined and implemented [7]	In 2017, according to the green metric, UNS was ranked 95 out of 619 universities for the assessment regarding green campus. The 144 m^2 medical center (including pharmacies) has both general practitioners and specialist doctors every day. The center consists of four divisions: General Health, Dental, Eye, and Ear, Nose and Throat (ENT).	It is recommended to review maintenance of facilities and infrastructure, such as fire extinguishers, to ensure that they are serviced in a timely manner and meet safety standard.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.1 Stakeholders' needs and feedback serve as input to curriculum design and development [1]	Some stakeholders' feedbacks are gathered by questionnaire, and through Student Internship Unit, Career Development Center, and the Alumni Family Association of Faculty of Agriculture. Students periodically deliver the feedback for the curriculum improvement through SIAKAD (www.siakad-old.uns.ac.id).	It is suggested to review the curriculum design process to ensure that all key stakeholders' needs are addressed so that the curriculum remains current and relevant. The systematic way to receive information and needs from lecturers and alumni should be concerned.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.2 The curriculum design and development process is established and subjected to evaluation and enhancement [2]	The SPA-UNS curriculum is arranged through workshops held every four years.	Formal mechanisms to engage the key stakeholders in curriculum design and review should be established.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.3 The teaching and learning processes and student assessment are continuously reviewed and evaluated to ensure their relevance and alignment [3]	Evaluation of the online teaching and learning process is conducted through SIAKAD (www.siakad-old.uns.ac.id). UNS has also implemented the Internal Quality Service Standards (SPMI) at programmes, faculties, and the university level to strengthen the quality assurance of the teaching and learning process.	It is recommended to review teaching and learning processes and student assessment in light of attaining both ELOs and CLOs.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
10. Quality Enhancement	10.4 Research output is used to enhance teaching and learning [4]	Several articles written by SPA-UNS lecturers which are published in national and international journals are also used as references for academic staff in the teaching/learning activities.	It is suggested to encourage more lecturers to use research output to enhance teaching & learning activities.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.5 Quality of support services and facilities (at the library, laboratory, IT facility and student services) is subjected to evaluation and enhancement [5]	Students are required to fill out an online questionnaire related to services and supporting facilities evaluation.	The programme may want to consider establishing systematic evaluation for service indicators and standards.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.6 The stakeholder's feedback mechanisms are systematic and subjected to evaluation and enhancement [6]	There were some stakeholders' feedback, i.e. questionnaire from employers, curriculum workshop from alumni and employers.	It is suggested to review the curriculum design process to ensure that stakeholders' needs are addressed so that the curriculum remains current and relevant. It is recommended to review types of key stakeholders.
11. Output	11.1 The pass rates and dropout rates are established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [1]	Dropout rates are established.	Benchmarking of output data, such as pass rate, on-time graduation, graduate employability, and research activities with other universities would be useful in seeking best practices.
11. Output	11.2 The average time to graduate is established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [1]	The average time to graduate are established and monitored from 2014/2015.	Since the academic year 2014/2015, the average time to graduate in the programme is higher than 4 years. Benchmarking of output data, such as pass rate, on-time graduation, graduate employability, and research activities with other universities, would be useful in seeking best practices.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
			The programme should analyze the root cause of non-GOT and provide other means of support to the students so that they can plan well and graduate on time.
11. Output	11.3 Employability of graduates is established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [1]	Since 2016, more than 65% of graduated could get the first job within six months after graduation. More than 50% of the graduates are working in the fields related to the study programme.	Benchmarking of output data, such as pass rate, on-time graduation, graduate employability, and research activities with other universities would be useful in seeking best practices.
11. Output	11.4 The types and quantity of research activities by students are established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [2]	Research topics of students are monitored from the academic year 2014/2015.	Benchmarking of research activities with other universities would be useful in seeking best practices. It is recommended to monitor types and quantity of research activities by students.
1. Output	11.5 The satisfaction levels of stakeholders are established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [3]	Employers' satisfaction survey of the SPA-UNS programme is collected since 2016. From the interview, students are satisfy to study in the programme	From employers' satisfaction data, LO pertaining to English communication skill should be reviewed. Teaching & learning strategies for this LO can be designed to enhance the English communication skill of the graduates.